

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 1 of 16
---	--	---------------------

Board Members Present

Jennifer Ferrera Schmid, President, Public Member
Dave Connolly, Vice President, Public Member
Matt Brooks, Public Member
David Hoppes, Dry Cargo Industry Member
Captain George Livingstone, Pilot Member
Captain Einar Nyborg, Pilot Member
John Schneider, Wet Cargo Industry Member
Marlon Flournoy, Deputy Secretary of the California State Transportation Agency (CalSTA)

Board Members Absent

None

Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director
Dennis Eagan, Board Counsel
Luis Cruz, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

Public Present

Knute Mike Miller, Past Board President and Pilot Fitness Committee Chairman; Captain Joseph Long, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent; Ray Paetzold, SFBP Business Director-General Counsel; Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President and General Counsel; Captains Steven Teague, David Cvitanovic, SFBP; Captain Arnold Kelso, SFBP Retiree; BOPC Trainees Captains Christopher Pyne Mercier, Jesse Pullin, Ronald Greger, and families; Rex Clack, Esq,

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to Order and Roll Call – President Schmid

President Schmid called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m. Associate Governmental Program Analyst Cruz called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes – President Schmid

Board action to approve the minutes from the Board meeting held on December 13, 2018.

Board members were presented with the draft minutes from the December 13, 2018, meeting. There was no discussion.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 2 of 16
---	--	---------------------

MOTION: President Schmid moved to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held December 13, 2018. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: Brooks.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

3. President Announcements and Activities – President Schmid

President Schmid congratulated Matt Brooks on his gubernatorial appointment to the Board, and welcomed him to his first Board meeting.

4. Board Member Announcements and Activities – Board Members

There were no announcements.

5. Directors’ Report – Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant

A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on December 13, 2018.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the correspondence and activities since the last Board meeting as follows:

- On December 19, 2018, Board staff received a copy of PMSA’s *West Coast Trade Report* for the month of December 2018, which contained the October 2018 container trade data and several other articles.
- On December 21, 2018, Board staff received a copy of a letter addressed to President Schmid from PMSA President John McLaurin, responding to her December 3, 2018 letter to Mr. McLaurin that addressed points made by Mr. McLaurin in an editorial contained in the August 2018 issue of PMSA’s *West Coast Trade Report*.
- On December 24, 2018, Board staff received an email from Captain Trevor Bozina, a candidate on the 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination eligibility list, requesting to be moved to the bottom of the list. Captain Bozina is currently training with Puget Sound Pilots.
- Also on December 24, 2018, Board staff received an email from Captain Glenn Merkel, a candidate on the 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination eligibility list, also requesting to be moved to the bottom of the list. He reported that Captain Merkel intends to begin training with the Maryland Board of Pilots on February 1, 2019.
- On December 28, 2018, he issued a letter to the Port Agent listing the 2019 first quarter surcharge rates.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 3 of 16
---	--	---------------------

- On December 31, 2018, Board staff received a letter from Captain Richard Hurt, announcing his intention to retire from piloting effective March 31, 2019.
- On January 3, 2019, Executive Director Garfinkle joined CalSTA Secretary Brian C. Annis and other Directors in Sacramento for a lunch hosted by Secretary Annis.
- On January 4, 2019, Board staff received an email from the National Maritime Center entitled, *Mitigation Efforts Due to Lapse in Fiscal Year 2019 Appropriations and Partial Governmental Shutdown*. He noted that one of the mitigation efforts described in the article is to extend the deadline for a Merchant Mariner Credential expiring between December 22, 2018, and January 31, 2019, by two months.
- On January 14, 2019, Board staff executed training contracts with two trainees from the 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination eligibility list—Captains Brett Nelson and Matthew Stevens. Following the signing of the contracts, both trainees were provided an orientation to the Board’s training program by Board staff and Pilot Evaluation Committee Chairman Captain Teague. Following that orientation, the trainees were escorted to the SFBP offices where they continued the orientation with SFBP Business Director-General Counsel Ray Paetzold and SFBP Pilot David McCloy.
- On January 15, 2019, Board staff received a copy of a letter from SFBP President Captain Long addressed to Mr. Peterson Vollmann, a City of Oakland Planner, detailing the SFBP’s concerns regarding the Oakland Waterfront Ballpark District Project on Howard Terminal.
- Also on January 15, 2019, Board staff received a notice from the Fair Political Practices Commission reminding Board staff of the mandated Conflict of Interest Code biennial review, and to complete the associated forms documenting this review.
- On January 16, 2019, Board staff received an email from SFBP Pilot Captain Carl Martin that noted he received excellent service from physicians and support staff at the University of California San Francisco upon the occasion of his annual fitness determination.
- On January 17, 2019, Commissioner Nyborg sent him an email that included a photo of Captain Carr climbing a very long rope pilot ladder. Commissioner Nyborg noted in the email that the pilot ladder was not used in conjunction with metal accommodation ladder, as that the swells were very deep, which could have presented a possibility of the pilot boat making contact with the accommodation ladder, had it been used.
- On January 22, 2019, Board staff, Pilot Evaluation Committee members, and staff members from the California Department of Human Resources (CalHR) met at the California State University Maritime Academy (CMA) for a kick-off meeting regarding the 2019 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination. CMA staff also provided a demonstration of the new simulator equipment and a run-through of the current draft version of the simulator exercise that will be used in the examination.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 4 of 16
---	--	---------------------

B) Report on pilot licensing matters in the past month and current month.

- Since the December Board meeting, the Board renewed the licenses of Captains Coppo, Robinson, Carlson, Ruff, and Kellerman.

C) Report on Board surcharges.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that for the month of December 2018, the Board received a check from the SFBP in the amount of \$175,114.03, itemized as follows:

- Board Operations Surcharge: \$ 83,754.03
- Continuing Education Surcharge: \$ 15,250.00
- Trainee Surcharge: \$ 72,030.00
- Abatement of Pension Plan Legal Fees: \$ 4,080.00

D) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated there were no legislative activities to report on.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported the following on contractual matters:

- The Department of General Services (DGS) approved the Board's contract with Mah & Associates for San Francisco Bar Pilot pension-calculation work. Board staff will meet with the firm soon to begin the transition of pension-calculation work to the firm.
- The Invitation for Bid for actuarial services for the San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan was issued on January 7, 2019. Bids are due February 6, 2019.
- Board staff are working on a contract amendment to the State Controller's Office contract to rearrange the budget, since audit costs exceeded projected costs for the 2017 audit. The total contract price remains unchanged.
- Board staff will need to amend the contract with the CMA for Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination Services due to a change in university staff working on the project. It is unknown yet if the contract budget amount will also need to be amended.
- Board staff were unable to work on crafting a contract with the CalHR for trainee random drug testing. Documents are expected to be drafted and provided to CHP in the next couple of months.

Commissioner Livingstone commented that the national pool of pilot trainees is small, and that Board continues to compete with other pilotage organization for new pilot trainees. He stated that the decision of advancing the upcoming Pilot Trainee Training Selection Examination by a year was a wise decision. Executive Director Garfinkle concurred, and

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 5 of 16
---	--	---------------------

stated that Board staff have commenced advertising for the 2019 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination in various media outlets.

Commissioner Livingstone also stated that he appreciated the response from PMSA's President, Mr. McLaurin, and looks forward to continue working cooperatively with the shipping industry to solve outstanding concerns.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for Commissioner Nyborg that the 2019 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination simulator testing evaluators have been identified, and that Board staff will work on preparing contracts with the evaluators in the near future.

Board members briefly discussed the competitiveness factors that may influence the decision of future applicants to apply for the Board's trainee program selection examination. Executive Director Garfinkle responded to a query from Commissioner Hoppes, and noted that the monthly trainee stipend amount and the higher-than-average cost of living San Francisco Bay Area were likely factors considered by trainees when deciding which pilot trainee training program to join. Port Agent Long noted that trainees likely also consider the additional job-related risks to pilots that involve offshore boarding in places such as San Francisco, New York/New Jersey and Columbia Bar pilotage grounds when the trainee selects the pilot trainee program to join.

6. Port Agent's Report – Captain Joseph Long

A) Monthly report on San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) pilot availability and absences.

Port Agent Long reported that Captain Kleess has been absent for medical reasons (AMFR) since November 26, 2018, and Captain Pate was AFMR commencing December 30, 2018, through January 19, 2019.

He reported that the SFBP continually monitors the dispatch list for possible 12-hour minimum rest period (MRP) exceptions, and if the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigating measures are employed by the SFBP. He reported that the mitigating measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings, cancelling previously granted compensating-time-off requests, suspending SFBP internal working rules, and calling in off-watch pilots.

He reported that there are currently 53 licensed pilots. He reported that there were 40 MRP exceptions in December 2018, and that the shortest rest period was 7.7 hours. Captain Long noted that mitigating some MRP exceptions takes active management by the Port Agent. He noted that the following factors that contributed to the 7.7 hour MRP exception:

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 6 of 16
---	--	---------------------

there was a new dispatcher on duty, a pilot stood in for him as Port Agent when he was not available, and the board was otherwise short during that time period.

B) Monthly report on SFBP ship piloting business activity.

Port Agent Long reported the following:

- The P/V SAN FRANCISCO has been out of service since September 4, 2018. The engine overhaul is complete and shipyard work is near completion. He reported that delays with the engine overhaul have caused a longer yard period than anticipated.

Port Agent Long reported the billed vessel moves for December 2018, as follows:

- Bar Crossings: 541 Moves
- Bay Moves: 145 Moves
- River Moves: 46 Moves
- Total Moves: 732 Moves
- Gross Registered Tons (GRT): 32.5 Million

He reported that when comparing 2018 year-to-date vessel-move data with the same period in 2017, total moves were down 0.5% and GRT was up 2.4%.

Port Agent Long reported the San Francisco Bar channel was closed for approximately 6 hours on the morning of January 17, 2019, starting approximately 11:00 a.m. He stated that the closure was due to severe weather, and that one ship arrival and one ship departure were impacted.

C) Monthly confidential written report of SFBP pilots who have been absent for medical reasons (AFMR). The Board may go into closed session to discuss contents of the Port Agent's confidential report as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code § 1157.1.

There was no discussion of the confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons. There was no closed-session discussion of this item.

7. Pilot Evaluation Committee – Captain Teague

A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meeting held on January 16, 2019.

PEC Chairman Captain Teague reported the following:

- The PEC met on January 16, 2019, and Committee members Captains Teague, Boriolo, Carlier, Haggerty, and Robinson, along with Captain Garfinkle, were present.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 7 of 16
---	--	---------------------

- In closed session, all trainees were interviewed and counseled individually by the PEC on their progress in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.
- The nine current trainees are Captains Burchard, Crawl, Corbett, Greger, Pullin, Pyne Mercier, Nelson, Starnitzky, and Stevens. The range of time in the program for these trainees spans 11 days to 25 months.
- Seven of the nine trainees have their full unlimited federal pilotage endorsements with the United States Coast Guard.
- All trainees are handling vessels as much as possible.
- Four trainees are in evaluation stage.
- Captains Nelson and Stevens commenced training on January 14, 2019, which included an orientation to the program. Both trainees have a considerable amount of limited tonnage San Francisco Bay pilotage on their federal license and are presently riding for unlimited tonnage route trips and general familiarization with the training program.
- All trainees are presently meeting the recommended benchmarks in the training program, and are progressing at their individual rates.
- The PEC Committee met with personnel from CMA, CalHR, and Board staff at the CMA campus on January 22, 2019. This was an introductory meeting with all Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination stakeholders, and an initial preview of the simulator-exercise portion of the upcoming selection examination. He stated that PEC members will participate in additional meetings and simulation-exam development as the exam-development process progresses.
- The next PEC meeting is scheduled for February 20, 2019, at 7:30 a.m. at the Board office.

B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program. Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.

There was no recommendation.

C) Possible PEC recommendation for a determination that a trainee has or trainees have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program. Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee who has completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

PEC Chairman Captain Teague reported that the PEC concluded its training of Captain Ronald Greger at its meeting on January 16, 2019, and determined that Captain Greger successfully completed all elements of Section 214(c) and (h) of the Pilot Trainee Training Program requirements listed in the Board's regulations. Captain Teague provided the following data:

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 8 of 16
---	--	---------------------

- Captain Greger completed a total of 708 training jobs with the San Francisco Bar Pilots, of which 231 were as an observer and 477 were handled or partially handled, during which Captain Greger directed the navigation and control of the vessel.
- Captain Greger completed 146 training jobs with PEC members, 27 of which were in the previous 90 days.
- As required by regulation, Captain Greger maintained an average PEC evaluation score of 4.0 or greater in each of the last three months, resulting in a three-month average score of 4.37.
- The PEC determined that Captain Greger has successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program and recommended that the Board issue Captain Greger a Certificate of Completion from the program, effective January 24, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for the Board that Captain Greger completed all of the Pilot Trainee Training Program requirements. There was no further discussion and no comments from the Board or the public.

MOTION: President Schmid moved to award Captain Ronald Greger a Pilot Trainee Training Program Certificate of Completion. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

PEC Chairman Captain Teague reported that the PEC completed its final assessment of Captain Jesse Pullin at its meeting on January 16, 2019, and determined that Captain Pullin successfully completed all elements of Section 214(c) and (h) of the Pilot Trainee Training Program requirements listed in the Board's regulations. Captain Teague provided the following data:

- Captain Pullin completed a total of 517 training jobs with the San Francisco Bar Pilots, of which 141 were as an observer and 376 were handled or partially handled, during which Captain Pullin directed the navigation and control of the vessel.
- Captain Pullin completed 91 jobs with PEC members, 24 of which were in the previous 90 days.
- As required by regulation, Captain Pullin maintained an average PEC evaluation score of 4.0 or greater in each of the last three months, resulting in a three-month average score of 4.43.
- The PEC determined that Captain Pullin has successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program, and recommended that the Board issue Captain Pullin a Certificate of Completion from the program, effective January 24, 2019.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 9 of 16
---	--	---------------------

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for the Board that Captain Pullin completed all of the Pilot Trainee Training Program requirements. There was no further discussion and no comments from the Board or the public.

MOTION: President Schmid moved to award Captain Jesse Pullin a Pilot Trainee Training Program Certificate of Completion. Commissioner Livingstone seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved.

D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the appointment of a new pilot or pilots. Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported to the Board that he has received applications for licensing from Captains Ronald Greger and Jesse Pullin, and that both trainees have met all of the Board's requirements for licensure. He recommended to the Board that since there are fewer than 60 pilots, licenses can be issued to Captains Greger and Pullin. There was no further discussion and no comments from the Board or the public.

MOTION: Commissioner Nyborg moved that the Board issue a license to Captain Ronald Greger. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

MOTION: Commissioner Livingstone moved that the Board issue a license to Captain Jesse Pullin. Commissioner Schneider seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 10 of 16
---	--	----------------------

President Schmid called for a short recess and administered the oath of office to Captains Greger and Pullin.

RECESS BEGAN: 10:16 a.m.

RETURN TO OPEN SESSION: 10:39 a.m.

8. Reported Safety Standard Violations – Executive Director Garfinkle
(Reported safety standard violations occurring up to the start of the meeting will be reported on.)

Report on the M/V SUNNY HORIZON starboard pilot ladder found deficient by pilot inbound from sea on January 1, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on January 2, 2019, he received a Pilot Boarding Arrangement Deficiency Report from Captain LeSieur dated January 1, 2019. The report stated that while embarking the M/V SUNNY HORIZON at the pilot station, Captain LeSieur observed that the lower rungs on the pilot ladder were heavily distorted. Captain LeSieur also observed evidence that the rungs on the pilot ladder were not horizontal and were in poor condition. Executive Director Garfinkle stated that he reported the event to the ship's agent, Port State Control, and the ship's next port of call in Los Angeles. He stated that he received an email from the M/V SUNNY HORIZON's Master detailing the corrective action plan and preventative measures taken by the vessel. Executive Director Garfinkle also stated that he received an email response from Captain John Dwyer, Chief Port Pilot II of the Los Angeles Pilot Group, thanking him for the notification.

Report on the M/V EVER SMART port side ladder found deficient by pilot inbound from sea on December 30, 2018.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on January 2, 2019, he received a Pilot Boarding Arrangement Deficiency Report from Captain Manes dated December 30, 2018. The report stated that while Captain Manes was embarking the M/V EVER SMART at the pilot station, he observed that the rungs on the port side were not horizontal and appeared to have slipped, and that the overall rigging of the ladder was poorly done. Captain Manes also observed that the spreader location at the entry to the side port would allow for the ladder to twist while a pilot was on ladder. Executive Director Garfinkle stated that no action was taken since the vessel departed to Taiwan on December 31, 2018.

Report on the M/V ATLANTIC CROWN man ropes found deficient by a Los Angeles pilot outbound to sea on January 17, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on January 17, 2019, he and the SFBP President received an email notification from Captain Dwyer of the Los Angeles Pilot Service, informing

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 11 of 16
---	--	----------------------

that there was a deficient man rope aboard the M/T ATLANTIC CROWN. The ship had left Los Angeles and was enroute to Richmond Long Wharf.

Report on the M/V HYUNDAI SHANGHAI man ropes found deficient by pilot on January 22, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on January 22, 2019, he received a Pilot Boarding Arrangement Deficiency Report from Captain Larwood dated January 22, 2019. The report stated that as Captain Larwood attempted to embark the vessel, the starboard ladder was unavailable due to due to mechanical issues. This issue produced a potentially dangerous boarding due to weather, traffic, and having to place the ship on a dangerous course headed for shoal water to create a lee and to take aggressive maneuvers to get the ship back to the channel.

Report on the M/V EVER LYRIC port side man rope found deficient by pilot outbound to sea on January 22, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on January 23, 2019, he received a Pilot Boarding Arrangement Deficiency Report from Captain Kirk dated January 22, 2019. The report stated that as Captain Kirk was disembarking the M/V EVER LYRIC the man rope parted on him at the pilot station. Captain Kirk recovered the parted manrope from the deck of the pilot vessel and observed that the rope was in overall poor condition. Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the Port Agent alerted Puget Sound Pilots of the issue, as that was the M/V EVER LYRIC's next port of call.

Commissioner Livingstone noted that the correspondence received from the M/V SUNNY HORIZON and the Los Angeles Pilot Service demonstrates the effectiveness of efforts taken by the Board in the advancement of maritime safety. He stated he is hopeful that this positive feedback communication loop continues.

Board members and members of the public discussed the dangers of parting man ropes, the seriousness of injuries that may occur, and efforts to continue the development of a wider and more formalized reporting system.

**9. Reportable Piloting Events – Executive Director Garfinkle
(Reportable piloting events occurring up to the start of the meeting will be reported on.)**

A) Progress report on the interaction between the M/V XING ZUN HAI while passing the mooring M/V WENCHE VICTORY in Stockton on October 4, 2018. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V XING ZUN HAI report at the Board meeting to be held on February 21, or February 28, 2019.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 12 of 16
---	--	----------------------

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on October 4, 2018, the M/V XING ZUN HAI was entering the Port of Stockton and passed the M/V WENCHE VICTORY, which was in the mooring process. He reported that during the M/V XING ZUN HAI passing the M/V WENCHE VICTORY, the M/V WENCHE VICTORY experienced some interaction that resulted in two mooring lines being parted. He reported there were pilots aboard both vessels, and that the event is still under investigation. He reported that the statutory 90-day investigation report deadline was January 1, 2019, and that the Incident Review Committee (IRC) has not yet completed its report. He stated that this report was not available at the December Board meeting and was not on the agenda for an extension, and as such the IRC requests that the Board retroactively grant an extension for a report submittal at the February Board meeting.

MOTION: Commissioner Connolly moved that the Board retroactively grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V XING ZUN HAI at the February 2019 Board meeting. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

B) Progress report on the unintended contact between the M/V ALYARMOUK and a temporary buoy marking the Fleet Week parade boundaries on October 7, 2018. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V ALYARMOUK report at the Board meeting to be held on February 21, or February 28, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on October 7, 2018, while the M/V ALYARMOUK was inbound from the pilot station, the vessel allided with a temporary buoy marking the Fleet Week air box show. He reported the statutory 90-day investigation report deadline was January 4, 2019, and that the IRC has not yet completed its report. He stated that this report was not available at the December Board meeting and was not on the agenda for an extension, and as such the IRC requests that the Board retroactively grant an extension for a report submittal at the February Board meeting.

Commissioner Brooks noted that due to the government shutdown, it was likely that the Freedom of Information Act request will take longer than usual, and as such, would it be possible to grant an extension longer than one month. Executive Director Garfinkle replied that the Board had in the past considered extending the time period for the IRC to submit a report to longer than 30 days, but preferred to grant extensions in monthly increments to be transparent and so that the Board could be timely informed of developments on an investigation taking longer than the statutory 90 days.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 13 of 16
---	--	----------------------

MOTION: Commissioner Livingstone moved that the Board retroactively grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V ALYARMOUK at the February 2019 Board meeting. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

C) Initial report of the M/V ARCTIC making unintended contact with the AMORCO dock (MRZ5) on December 2, 2018.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on December 2, 2018, while the M/V ARCTIC in the process of mooring at the Amorco pier (MRZ5), the vessel's bow made unintended contact with the dock structure, resulting in minor damage to the pier structure. He stated that the event is under investigation, and the statutory 90-day investigation report deadline is March 1, 2019. He stated that no Board action was required at this time.

10. Loss-of-Propulsion/Low-Sulfur-Fuel Report – Executive Director Garfinkle

Report on loss-of-propulsion events arising in November and December 2018, as reported by the U.S. Coast Guard, including those events suspected to be due to low-sulfur-fuel issues.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that according to the U.S. Coast Guard's Prevention/Response-San Francisco Harbor Safety Statistics report for the month of November 2018, there was one loss-of-propulsion event, and that the event was not attributed to fuel switching.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that according to the U.S. Coast Guard's Prevention/Response-San Francisco Harbor Safety Statistics report for the month of December 2018, there was one loss-of-propulsion and one-loss-of-steering event, and that neither event was attributed to fuel switching.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 14 of 16
---	--	----------------------

11. Navigation Technology Equipment and Software Acquisition Update – SFBP Business Director-General Counsel Paetzold

Status report on the SFBP’s navigation technology equipment and software implementation.

Mr. Paetzold reported that the route-piloting-system and the precision-docking-equipment units are working well. He stated there was nothing else to report.

12. Pilot Fitness Committee – Knute Michael Miller

A) Report on the Pilot Fitness Committee meeting held on January 17, 2019.

Commissioner Nyborg gave a report on Pilot Fitness Committee Chairman Miller’s behalf and reported that the Committee met on January 17, 2019. He stated the Committee discussed recent beneficial administrative changes to the Board’s fitness determination process involving the University of California, San Francisco Campus’ (UCSF) Division of Occupational & Environmental Medicine. He reported that the Committee also continued its review of the Pilot Fatigue Study (Study) produced by the San Jose State University Research Foundation in collaboration with NASA for the development of pilot fatigue mitigation regulations.

B) Progress report on the Committee’s review of relevant sections of Board statutes, Board regulations, Senate Bill 1408 (2012), and recommendations from the July 2018 San Francisco Bar Pilot Fatigue Study prepared by the San Jose State University Research Foundation and the National Aeronautics and Space Administration.

Commissioner Nyborg reported that at its January 17, 2019, meeting, the third Committee meeting to review the Study, the Committee commenced a thorough review of the Study recommendations with the intent of identifying recommendations that were amendable to regulations. He reported that the Committee also discussed the concepts of “hard stops” and “soft stops,” and the development by the SFBP of a Fatigue Risk Management System. He reported that the Committee is scheduled to meet next on February 26, 2019.

Commissioner Hoppes inquired if the implementation of “hard stops” and “soft stops” would reduce or eliminate MRP exceptions. Port Agent Long responded stating that it would depend on where the limits are placed, and that this topic remains an item of discussion.

Commissioner Hoppes requested that the Board and Pilot Fitness Committee ensure that all the recommendations contained within the Pilot Fatigue Study were appropriately addressed and reviewed. Commission Nyborg stated that the Committee will continue to

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 15 of 16
---	--	----------------------

review all of the Study recommendations, and noted that not all of the recommendations lend themselves to the creation of a regulation. Executive Garfinkle reminded the Board that SB 1408 requires the Board to develop a regulation for a minimum rest period, and noted that the efforts assumed by the Committee are exceeding the statutory mandate. Commissioner Livingstone stated that the SFBP has yet to have an incident attributed to fatigue, and that the pilots take fatigue-related issues very seriously.

13. Board discussion of best practices in Maritime Safety – Vice President Connolly

A Board discussion of best practices in maritime safety and/or lessons from Incident Review Committee incident reports or other sources, and possible directions to staff to develop safety policies and procedures. Possible Board action to direct staff to develop maritime safety policies and procedures.

Vice President Connolly referred to the earlier discussion of pilot ladder deficiencies, and noted the importance of the further development of pilot ladder incident reporting best practices.

Vice President Connolly stated that since the last Board meeting, there were two fires at sea, and in both cases the ships were abandoned, and both vessels were towed to ports. He inquired about the pilot's role in responding to a fire or similar emergencies aboard vessels within the Board's jurisdiction. Board members briefly discussed local interagency communications and emergency response protocols, and deemed the discussion appropriate for the Harbor Safety Committee.

14. Board Meeting Calendar for 2019 – Executive Director Garfinkle

Possible Board action to change February meeting date from February 21, 2019 to February 28, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle presented a revised 2019 Board meeting calendar, and explained that the 2019 Board meeting schedule developed by staff, which the Board approved on October 25, 2018, included a meeting date on February 21, 2019, which was not in keeping with the traditional Board meeting date of the fourth Thursday of each month. Board members briefly discussed the option of moving the Board meeting on February 21, 2019, to February 28, 2019. There was no further discussion and no comments from the public.

MOTION: President Schmid moved that the Board change the February Board meeting date from February 21, 2019, to February 28, 2019. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.

Meeting Date: January 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 16 of 16
---	--	----------------------

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

15. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

16. Proposals for the next Board meeting agenda.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant noted that Board staff will include an agenda item on the February Board meeting agenda for presentation of the January 2019 Pilot Retirement Survey results, and the annual Executive Director performance review.

17. Adjournment.

MOTION: President Schmid moved to adjourn the meeting. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved and the meeting adjourned at 11:30 a.m.

Submitted by:

